



International Journal of Built Environment and Sustainability Published by Penerbit UTM Press, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia IJBES 7(2)/2020, 67-77

Psychometric Testing of Shopping Mall Universal Design Assessment Tool (SM-UD)

Rebaz Jalil Abdullah

School of Architecture and Fine Art, Dalian University of Technology, Dalian 116024, China

Tang Jian

School of Architecture and Fine Art, Dalian University of Technology, Dalian 116024, China Email: tangjian@dlut.edu.cn

ABSTRACT

While there are people with disability live in Kurdish parts of Iraq, a very limited number of buildings are properly designed to serve these people. Considering the challenges that people with disability face in public buildings, the United Nations has recommended the implementation of the Universal Design (UD) principles in public buildings in Iraq to ensure that all people could have access to the public buildings regardless of their abilities and backgrounds. Hence, there is a need to gather pertinent data by assessing the adherence of shopping malls in this part of Iraq to the Universal Design (UD) principles given the role of the facilities to the locals. The present study aims to develop a tool for assessing whether the shopping malls in Sulaymaniyah city adhere to Universal Design principles. An analytical tool, which was abbreviated as SM-UD, was developed using a wide range of shopping mall design elements. The tool was tested for reliability and validity through several statistical tests. Besides, the tool was tested for practicality and communicability in six different shopping malls of Sulaymaniyah. The reliability and validity test indicate that the majority of items showed good to excellent reliability and fair to excellent validity. The results of using the tool show that it is capable of identifying the drawbacks of shopping malls in terms of their universality of design. The proposed tool appears ready to be used by shopping malls' managers and researchers.

1. Introduction

More than 1 billion people around the world suffer from various types of disability WHO (2013). This equals to nearly 15% of the world's population. Countries like Iraq involved in several wars in the two recent decades. Thus, the higher number of People with Disability (PWDs) is expected in different parts of this country. Over 100 thousand PWDs live in Kurdish part of Iraq (European Network on Independent Living 2018). A recent report by the United Nations Assistance Mission for Iraq (UNAMI 2016) determined the PWDs challenges in Iraq and proposed a number of solutions to alleviate the PWDs daily challenges.

Article History

Received : 4 November 2019 Received in revised form : 11 February 2020 Accepted : 7 March 2020 Published Online : 30 April 2020

Keywords:

Universal Design; Shopping malls; Sulaymaniyah city; assessment tool.

Corresponding Author Contact:

tangjian@dlut.edu.cn

DOI: 10.11113/ ijbes.v7.n2.497

© 2020 Penerbit UTM Press. All rights reserved

This report considered the huge number of PWDs in Iraq as a serious issue and emphasized on the necessity of implication of implication of Universal Design (UD) across the Iraq to ensure the accessibility of different places to the PWDs.

Broadly speaking, UD is a design concept that attempts to accommodate a broader range of users irrespective of their backgrounds and abilities (Baer, Bhushan et al. 2016). Despite the development of several UD guidelines across the globe, very limited number of assessment tools are available which measure the adherences of the built environments to the UD principles. Several public places such as malls, parks, hospitals, and so on are needed to be inspected to ensure these places are suitable for PWDs, children, and seniors.

Shopping mall is an important part of urban life in cities of developing countries. There are several shopping malls in the Kurdish part of Iraq, which have not been assessed for adherence to the UD principles. Literature also confirms that, to date, there is no systematic approach to assess the suitability of shopping malls in Iraq, particularly the Kurdish Part (Jalil Abdullah and Jian 2019). This paper presents a part of wider research endeavor to leverage the use of UD in the design and assessment of shopping malls in Kurdish part of Iraq. The authors identified and confirmed the contributory design factors of shopping malls to the UD principles in Jalil Abdullah and Jian (2019). In this paper, the authors aim to illustrate the development process of a tool for assessing the shopping malls in Kurdish part of Iraq based on UD concept. This paper is structured as follows. The next section reviews definition and its principles of the UD and its translation into the shopping complex design criteria, reviews the existing design guidelines and standards of the UD in shopping malls, and the design factors of shopping malls. In method section, the mathematical modeling and case study are presented. We conclude the paper with some discussions and recommendations for future research.

2. Background

Story (1998) defined the Universal Design as the "design of products and environments that can be used and experienced by people of all ages and abilities, to the greatest extent possible, without adaptation". The UD has seven main principles, including equitable use, flexibility in use, simple and intuitive use, perceptible information, tolerance for error, low physical effort, and size and space for approach and use. However, implementation of these principles in practice is complicated (Story, Mueller et al. 1998).

UD has been applied in several fields of research, including but not restricted to education, production, and built environment design. Although more than two decades is passed from the proposing UD for different purposes, a very limited number of tools have been developed for assessing the adherence of the design or products to the UD principles. Stephanidis, Akoumianakis et al. (1998) proposed guidelines that were subsequently translated into key development requirements which were preserved in user interface development tools for them to provide the required support for building user interface software for different users and contexts of use. Lenker, Nasarwanji et al. (2011) developed the Rapid Assessment of Product Usability & Universal Design (RAPUUD), a 12-item user-report tool based on the principles of universal design. Oh (2015) developed the design evaluation tool and guidelines of universal design for applying to the design of different spaces, including residential space, educational space, working space, and cultural space.

Concerning education, Fogarty (2017) proposed a clinical practice assessment tool to create access and equity for all students.

The body of literature is extremely thin regarding the implementation of UD in shopping malls. A number of studies attempted to identify problems of the application of restroom facilities, entrance and circulation facilities, and signage system to produce alternative solutions to those problems based on UD in the shopping centers of Surabaya, Indonesia (Kusumarini, de Yong et al. 2012, Kusumarini, de Yong et al. 2012, Kusumarini, de Yong et al. 2012). These studies used qualitative research and design thinking approach to assess the shopping malls. However, the qualitative approach of these studies might result in subjective assessment. Afacan and Erbug (2009) proposed a framework to heuristically evaluate the adherence of shopping malls to the UD principles. However, their proposed method was complicated and time-consuming.

More recently, Jalil Abdullah and Jian (2019) translated the general definition of UD into the shopping mall design criteria. In their translation, the shopping malls should be design in a way to accommodate all shoppers and visitors regardless of their backgrounds and abilities. Besides, the design of shopping malls should provide the shoppers with a usable, safe, and comfortable environment to the shoppers. They also used a structural equation modelling (SEM) to identify the most important shopping mall design factors based on UD. These factors are used in the present study to develop an easy to follow tool for assessing the adherence of the shopping malls to the UD principles.

Many countries around the world set the rules which ask the authorities of the public places follow the Universal Design principles. For example, the government of Dubai provides a detailed UD guideline in terms of built environment and transportation facilities (Dubai 2017). This UD guideline defines how the built environment and transportation systems in the Emirate should be designed, constructed and managed to enable one to approach, enter, use, egress from and evacuate independently, in an equitable and dignified manner, to the greatest extent possible, in line with the Universal Design concept. Many other countries across the globe also provide the same regulations and codes to the architectures, practitioners, and managers to serve all people regardless of their abilities and backgrounds.

More recently, the universal design principles have established in South Korea as a fundamental basis in developing and designing elderly residential houses, public spaces and public facilities. The knowledge of diversity for people especially in disability and elderly have been affected by universal design principles. The Universal Design removes all obstructions and encourages people to live, use and access all facilities easily without any barrier (Harsritanto, 2016).

Malaysian has also shown some development in catering to the need of persons with disabilities (PWD). Nevertheless, as appealed by Kamal Malhotra, the United Nations Resident Coordinator, in the National Conferences on "Accessibility and Universal Design: Implications for Public Transport and the Built Environment", yet, there is the need to efficiently implement universal design in Malaysia, the need for more professionals or researchers in this area, and the need to revisit the current standards codes. Thus, their study was called to enhance and complement the precedent studies that have been done on Malaysia accessibility issues and universal design implementation in public buildings (Kadir and Jamaludin 2012).

In recent years, in order to confirm the universal design and increased accessibility, many acts and regulations have been amended in Norway. The action plan is intended to support the implementation of the new Anti-Discrimination and Accessibility Act, new Planning and Building Act and other new legislation dealing with universal design. The action plan is also intended to help meet Norway's obligations when Norway ratifies the UN Convention on the Rights of People with disabilities. The government's vision that Norway is to be universally designed by 2025 can be achieved using various instruments that are adapted to suit the various sectors and tasks. Goals that are subject to deadlines are used (EQUALITY 2009).

3. Method

3.1 Design Factors

As pointed out earlier, the present paper is an extension of previous work aimed at translating the general definition of UD into the shopping mall design criteria and identifying the most important design factors of shopping malls based on UD principles, in a Kurdish context.

The authors conducted a literature review to first, translate the general definition of UD and its principles into the shopping complex design criteria; and second, to identify the widest range of design elements of shopping complexes and their contributions to the UD translated. The authors used expert opinions in two rounds. In the first round, the UD translated and the design elements identified were sent to a panel of experts who were asked to read and discuss the translations and the design elements. They were instructed to comment on each translation and design element, as well as to identify important elements that were missing or should be deleted.

Thus, the authors made some modifications based on the expert's comments. For example, in terms of UD translation and the new categorization, a number of unclear definitions (e.g., definitions of usability and comfort) were clarified to create a comprehensive theoretical classification. Concerning the design elements and their contribution to the UD translated aspects, the experts suggested that we add a number of design elements (e.g., stairs) to the list. The experts also considered more contributions of design elements to the UD translated aspects (usability, comfort, and safety). In fact, the experts confirmed that all the design elements identified have contributions to all three aspects of usability, comfort, and safety. The authors then used a Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) technique as a confirmatory analysis to determine the weighting of the stable extracted factors

Consequently, the authors have developed a tool using the design factors identified in Jalil Abdullah and Jian (2019), which are shown in Table 1. To develop the tool, we needed standards to compare the existing condition with the ideal condition. Thus, we have used some well-known UD guidelines that are widely available. In table 1, many UD standards are considered for each design factor.

Table 1 Tool items and standards

Design factor	Source	uı	O standard(s)
		1	The internal stairs should be clearly visible and easy to identify.
		2	The spiral stairs or stairs with tapered treads should be avoided.
		3	The rise of stairs should be in the range 150mm to 180mm. The depth should be in the range 300mm to 450mm.
		4	Steps' edge should have a non-slip applied nosing.
<u>.</u>	(Centre for Excellence in	5	Clear width of stairs should not be less than 1200mm.
Stairs	Universal Design 2014)	6	Single steps should be avoided.
	C I	7	Tactile hazard warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight should be provided.
		8	Handrails should be provided to both sides of stairs.
		9	Second handrail at a lower height should be provided to both sides of stairs.
		10	The handrails should be contrasted with surrounding surfaces.
		11	Illumination of stairs should not be less than 150 lux.
		1	Ramps should have a gradient not exceeding 1 in 20.
		2	Clear width of ramp should not be less than 1500mm.
		3	The length of landings should not be less than 2000 mm and the width should be equal
	(Contro for Excellence in		to the width of the ramp.
Ramps	(Centre for Excenence in Universal Design 2014)	4	Handrails should be provided to the ramp and landings.
	Universal Design 2014)	5	Second handrail at a lower height should be provided.
		6	The ramp slope should contrast visually with landing surfaces.
		7	Tactile hazard warning surfacing should not be used on ramp.
		8	Upstanding kerb should be available along the ramp with 100mm high.

		9	Ramp Illumination should be more than 150 lux at the ramp surface.
		1	The lift should be located adjacent to an accessible flight of stairs.
		2	Internal dimensions should be at least 1800mm x 1800mm.
		3	Visual and tactile floor numbers should be available at each landing.
		4	Signaling systems of visual and audible should be available at the lift.
Elevators	(Centre for Excellence in	5	Control buttons with any mounting plate should be contrasted.
	Universal Design 2014)	6	Mounting plate with the adjacent wall surface should be contrasted.
		7	An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users should be available.
		8	Illumination at lift should be more than 100 Lux at tread level.
		9	Half-height mirror to rear wall should be available at elevator.
		1	Width of opening should be 1000mm and more.
_		2	Vision panels should be incorporated into all entrance lobby doors visually contrasting
Doors	(Centre for Excellence in	_	markings.
appearance	Universal Design 2014)	3	Entrance doors should be visually contrast with adjacent walls or screens.
		4	Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors should be available.
Maneuvering	(Centre for Excellence in	1	The dimension of maneuvering space should be in the range 2440 mm \times 2440 mm for
space	Universal Design 2014)		swing doors and 1100 mm \times 1370 mm for sliding doors.
		1	Service desks should be located in a logical position with direct access from main
			entrance.
		2	Counters at different heights should be available.
Service desks	(Centre for Excellence in	3	Knee recess for people in seated position should be available.
	Universal Design 2014)	4	2440mm × 2440mm or more clear space for approach to desk should be provided.
		5	Ensure counter has visually-contrasting.
		6	Illumination at counter level should be more than 200 lux at tread level.
		1	Different toilet height should be available.
	(ADA 2010) The City of	2	Automatic activated flush systems should be available
Restrooms	Calgary 2010, Austrailian Government	3	Color contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) should be
		9	available
	2013 Ministry of	4	Different hand basins height should be available
Business Innovation and Employment 2019)		5	Color contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) should
			be available
	2p.0)ee 2012)	6	Grab rails in toilet should be provided
	(Centre for Excellence in	1	The dimension of hallways should be in range of 1600mm × 1900mm
Hallways	Universal Design 2014)	2	Iunctions between different floor finishes should be fixed with threshold plates
		1	Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs: people using
		1	wheelchairs and electric scooters: and for assistance dogs should be available
	(Centre for Excellence in	2	Obstruction of circular routes by seats should be avoided
Waiting areas	Universal Design 2014)	3	Clear sisle to the front and rear of the block of seats should be provided for all seat
	aniversui Design 2017)	5	blocks
		4	Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces should be available
		1	The direction of movement of escalators should be clearly indicated with a sign at the
		1	top and bottom
		2	Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator should be available
		3	Escalator dimensions should be in range of 580mm and 1100 mm for width and
		4	240mm for height
	(Centre for Excellence in	5	Visually contrasting hand at each step should be available
Escalators	Universal Design 2014)	6	Vertical clearance (2300mm and more) should be provided
	universal Design 2014)	7	Clear approach (10m long and more) area should be provided.
		8	Level moving section should be 2000mm long and more for ten of escalator and
		0	1600mm long and more for bottom of oscilator
		9	Audible warning at the top and bottom of the assolutor should be provided
		2 10	Emergency stop control should be provided
		10	Width of path of traval should be 2000mm and more
		1	show contrictions should be 1200mm and more.
	(Contro for EIl	∠ 2	The wall mounted items should be fully recently along the constitution
Path of travel	Universal Design 2014)	э 4	The projections should be fully guarded along the corridor.
	universal Design 2014)	+ 5	The projections should be provided at 20 m or less intervals along the corridor.
		5	The seats should be provided at 20 m or less intervals along the corridor.
		6	I he furniture should not obstruct the path of travel.

Architectural wayfinding	(Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment 2019, Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment 2019)	1 2	Visual links with the outside should be provided on circulation routes. Many glares in the internal environment should be provided.
Graphical wayfinding	(Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment 2019, Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment 2019)	1 2	Visual, tactile and audible information in signage should be incorporated. Signage should be clear, consistent, and easy to understand.

3.2 Mathematical Definition

Mathematically, the SM-UD score can be defined as follows:

 $SM - UD_{score} = \sum_{i=1}^{13} S_j W_j$ (1)

Here, SM-UD score = shopping mall universal design score, W = normalized weight of shopping mall indicator, S = indicator score, and J = indicator number.

The weight of each indicator is presented in Table 2. The weights were achieved in Jalil Abdullah and Jian (2019) that used a structural equitation modelling (SEM) technique to propose a model for shopping complex design based on Universal Design concept. According to this study, each shopping mall complex contributed in one or more aspects of Universal Design. The association value of each design factor with the UD aspect was considered as a weight. Then, for each design factor, the sum of the values was calculated and considered as the final raw weight. Finally, the raw weights

were normalized to the range from 0 to 100.

Table 1 Indicators' weight according to Jalil Abdullah and Jian (2019)

Usability	Safety	Comfort	Sum	Normalized Weight
0.5	0.5	0.64	1.64	11.14
0.51			0.51	3.46
0.64	0.62	0.59	1.85	12.57
0.51	0.54	0.66	1.71	11.62
0.51		0.53	1.04	7.07
0.99	0.99	0.56	2.54	17.26
0.82	0.59		1.41	9.58
	0.51	0.55	1.06	7.20
	0.59		0.59	4.01
		0.62	0.62	4.21
		0.65	0.65	4.42
		0.59	0.59	4.01
		0.51	0.51	3.46
	Usability 0.5 0.51 0.64 0.51 0.99 0.82	Usability Safety 0.5 0.5 0.51 0.62 0.51 0.54 0.51 0.99 0.99 0.99 0.82 0.59 0.59 0.59	Usability Safety Comfort 0.5 0.5 0.64 0.51 0.64 0.62 0.59 0.51 0.54 0.66 0.51 0.54 0.66 0.51 0.53 0.53 0.99 0.99 0.56 0.82 0.59 0.51 0.55 0.62 0.59 0.62 0.59 0.65 0.59 0.59 0.51 0.55 0.59	Usability Safety Comfort Sum 0.5 0.5 0.64 1.64 0.51 0.51 0.51 0.64 0.62 0.59 1.85 0.51 0.54 0.66 1.71 0.51 0.54 0.66 1.71 0.51 0.54 0.66 1.71 0.51 0.53 1.04 0.99 0.99 0.56 2.54 0.82 0.59 1.41 0.51 0.55 1.06 0.59 0.59 0.59 0.62 0.62 0.62 0.65 0.65 0.65 0.59 0.59 0.59 0.59 0.59 0.59

To achieve the SM-UD score, the S must be calculated. To assess each shopping mall design factor, one or more assessment items are proposed. The S for each shopping mall design factor is achieved by calculating the mean score from all assigned evaluators' assessment scores to the assessment items. Therefore, the factor assessment score is defined as follows:

$$S_j = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{\substack{1 \le i \le n \\ 1 \le j \le 13}} M_{ij} \tag{2}$$

Here, S = design factor assessment score, M = mean score of the statements within each design factor, i = number assigned to the assessment items (referring to Table 1), j = number assigned to the shopping mall design factor (referring to Table 3), and n = total number of assessment items within each shopping mall design factor.

Explaining the results of SM-UD by means of percentage facilitates the understanding of the SM-UD value. This percentage show scores that existing shopping malls can achieve from total possible points. The percentage of SM-UD is indicated as follows:

$$SM - UD\% = \frac{K - UDS \, Score}{\sum_{j=1}^{13} PS_j w_j} \times 100$$
(3)

Here, PSJ = the highest possible score

Table 4 presents the different range of scores, descriptions, and required levels of improvement (RLI). SM-UD 'A' ($80 \leq$ SM-UD $\% \leq 100$) indicates that the shopping mall is in very good condition. SM-UD 'B' ($60 \le$ SM-UD % < 80) indicates that the shopping mall is in good condition and limited improvements are needed. SM-UD 'C' ($40 \leq$ SM-UD % < 60) means the shopping mall condition is acceptable, but needs some improvements. SM-UD 'D' ($20 \le$ SM-UD % < 40) and 'E' ($0 \le$ SM-UD % < 20) show that the shopping mall are in poor condition and not appropriate for using; these shopping malls attention to be improve need to get special

Table 2 Assessment items of the shopping mall design factors

Imm ID Ascessment item Imm ID Ascessment item a. Circulton Electors: Starts f Circulton Electors: Electors a.1 Widbhry of starts with tupered traval f.1 It the lift focality adjustment item and adjustment item and adjustment item and adjustment item a.3 steps' filtereisin f.3 Visual and tastile Boor numbers at each lading a.4 Steps with projecting noting f.4 The lift spatiality system is both stand and adjustment item b.5 Clorw with of starts f.6 Constrast of correl bottors with any mounting plate a.6 Stagle steps f.6 Constrast of correl bottors with any mounting plate a.7 Tactiel baard varining arriface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 As emergency communication system that is suitable for all items a.8 Hourbulk f.8 Biomation at lift f.0 a.10 Bianation of starts g.1 Wild of opening b.1 Karge gradient g.3 Vision panels b.2 Clor with of starts g.3 Vision panels b.3 Lading-dimensions g.5 Contrast of starts				
a Circulton Elements - State f Circulton Elements - Elevators 11 Violally of states f.1 Is bell filts cost allocation to an accessible flight of states? 4.2 Spiral ratio or static with tapered treads f.2 Minimum internal dimensions of 1800mm x 1800mm 4.3 Sopy ⁴ dimension f.3 Visal and textife floor numbers of stath handing 4.4 Sopy ⁴ dimension f.5 Contrast of coursel buffers in both shall and guffer 4.5 Sopy ⁴ dimension f.5 Contrast of coursel buffers with synchrony state buffers 4.6 Stagle steps f.6 Contrast of coursel buffers with synchrony state buffers 4.7 Tactife havard warning surfaces at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An energyper communication system that is surface for all users. 4.8 Handradis f.8 Billimitation at his f.8 4.9 Secold hardinal at a lower height f.9 Half height animor to rar wall. 1.0 Window States g.1 With of operaing 5.1 Reade hardinal at a lower height g.1 Billing and an and theight and anone state toperaing 5.1 <td>Item ID</td> <td>Assessment item</td> <td>Item ID</td> <td>Assessment item</td>	Item ID	Assessment item	Item ID	Assessment item
1 Vielnity of tains? f.1 Is the lift located adjacent to an accessful light of tains? 4.2 Spirel stains or stains with typered troub f.2 Minimum internal dimensions of 1900ma x 1800ma 4.3 Steps' dimension f.3 Visual and tactle flow rombers at each landing 4.4 Steps with presenting plate f.6 Contrast of control bottom with any nonsing plate 4.6 Single steps f.6 Contrast of normaling plate with the adjacent and another 4.7 Tactile based warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users. 4.8 Hardrals f.8 Bhornastion of thir 4.9 Social handral at lower height f.9 Hild-height minor to rear wall. 4.10 Visial contrast of handrals with surrounding outfaces g.0 Pertering and Fisting Elements - Doors Appearance 4.11 Wissian gradient g.1 With d'agoetti minors or and wall. 5.2 Clear walls of transp g.2 Visian panels 5.4 Handrals h Entering and Exiting Elements - Samp 6.4 Handralk h Entering and Exiting Stemast vision of samp 6.5 Social handral at a lower height h.1 Dimension (full aldy) 6.6 Contrat of tran	a	Circulation Elements - Stairs	f	Circulation Elements - Elevators
4.2 Spinal statics or statics with tapered treads f.2 Minimum interval dimensions of 1800mm x 1800mm 6.3 Steppi dimension f.3 Visual and attachile four numbers a cash hording 6.4 To Explicit points f.4 The fitting spating system is both visual and addition 7.4 To Explicit heard suming surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 Contrast of mounting plate with the adjacent wall write? 8.8 Handrah f.8 Elimination at hif 8.9 Scond hardrah visu warrong surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An energyme communication system that is suitable for all users. 8.11 Minimum instructions the static system of a flight f.8 Elimination at hif 8.9 Scond hardrah visu warrong gardree at the top and bottom of a flight f.9 Half-Soglt more top are val. 8.11 Minimum instructions themeses g.1 Wisual contracting markage 9.1 Reserve with of yearse g.2 Visual postfacent val. 9.1 Reserve with of transp g.2 Visual postfacent val. 9.1 Reserve with of transp g.5 Contracting markage 9.2 Visual postfacent val. With of opening 9.3 Landing dimensions g.5 Contracting and Exing Elements - Architectural Wayfunding (Overall Wayfunding Goveranc	a.1	Visibility of stairs	f.1	Is the lift located adjacent to an accessible flight of stairs?
4.3 Step 4 dimension 6.3 Visual and tachel floor numbers at cale handing 4.4 Step with projecting unsing 1.4 The lift signifing system is hold visual and analitie 4.5 Clear width of stain 1.5 Cuntrast of cuntral buttens with any mounting plate with the signest wall surface 4.6 Single steps 6.6 Contrast of cuntral buttens with any mounting plate with the signest wall surface 4.7 Tactic hourd warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight 1.7 An encrepsery communication system that is surfable for all users. 4.8 Handrali 1.8 Illumination at lift 4.9 Second hundral at lower height 6.9 Illufflesight mirror tor car atll. 4.10 Wand contrast of hundrals with arrounding surfaces g.1 Within of opening b Creation Elements - Kampa g.2 Visual contrasting markings b.1 Range gadient g.3 Visually contrasting markings b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entering and Easting Elements - Manemeering Space b.3 Landing dimensions g.5 Contrast of ramp alop with landing surface b.4 Handralit h.1 Dimensions (plane) b.5 Social hundral at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (plane with internese gadis doors) b.	a.2	Spiral stairs or stairs with tapered treads	f.2	Minimum internal dimensions of 1800mm x 1800mm
4.4 Steps with projecting noting f.4 The fit signiling system is both you and addible 4.5 Clear width of stains f.5 Contrast of mounting plate with the signeen wall surface 6.6 Steps steps f.6 Contrast of mounting plate with the signeen wall surface 6.7 Tactlic bazard warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An energency communication system that is suitable for all users. 8.8 Hundralis f.8 Illifheight mirror to rear wall. 8.9 Social hundral it a lower height f.9 Halfheight mirror to rear wall. 8.10 Usaid contrast is all ower height f.9 Halfheight mirror to rear wall. 8.11 Illifheight mirror to rear wall. f.9 Halfheight mirror to rear wall. 8.12 Clear width of ramp g.2 Vision panch b.1 Rampe godient g.3 Visual contrast visually with adjacent walls or screeses b.4 Handralis h Eastrace door contrast visually with adjacent walls or screeses b.4 Handralis h Eastrace door contrast visually with adjacent walls or screeses b.5 Second hundral at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of mountax visual addient down with screeses g.5 b.7 Tactlie bazard var	a.3	Steps' dimension	f.3	Visual and tactile floor numbers at each landing
a.5 Clor width of stars f.5 Constrat of control buttons with any mounting plate a.6 Single steps f.6 Cuntrat of control buttons with any mounting plate a.7 Tastic buard warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users. a.8 Handralh f.8 Hummation at ith a.9 Sound humdal at a lower hugh f.9 Hallbeght mirror to rear wall. a.10 Visual contrast of badrath with surroanding surfaces g Entering and Fixing Flemous - Door Apporance a.11 Ill miniation of aim g.1 Width of opening b.1 Ramge gadvent g.3 Visually contrasting marking b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entering and Exiting Elements - Manovering Space b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Curtrasting furtheres glass doors b.4 Handralh h Entering and Exiting Elements - Anchitectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.5 Social humbral at lower height h.1 Dimensions of thai at lower height b.4 Handralh Entering and Exiting Elements - Anchitectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.6 Contrast of contrast at exit and anable information in signage at the exit and anable information in signagade b.7 Tastich	a.4	Steps with projecting noising	f.4	The lift signalling system is both visual and audible
a.6 Single steps f.6 Cortrast of mounting plate with the adjacent wall surface a.7 Tactile bizerd warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight f.7 An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users. a.8 Handrails f.8 Illumination at the adjacent wall surface a.9 Second handrail at lower height f.9 IllaHbeight mirror to rear wall. a.10 Visual contrast of hundrails with surrounding surfaces g.1 Within opening b.1 Circulation Elements - Ramping g.2 Vision panels b.2 Chern wildin of ramp g.4 Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Cortrasting strip on edges of frameless glass discors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensiona (pull side) b.6 Contrast of many slop with landing surface 1 Wayfinding (lowerall Assessment) b.7 Tactlic hazard warning surfacing on ramps 1.1 Provision of visual lands with subside individual worfinding b.7 Tactlic hazard warning surfacing on ramps 1.1 Provision of visual lands with subside individual worfinding c.7 Tactlic hazard warning surfacing on ramps 1.1 <td>a.5</td> <td>Clear width of stairs</td> <td>f.5</td> <td>Contrast of control buttons with any mounting plate</td>	a.5	Clear width of stairs	f.5	Contrast of control buttons with any mounting plate
a.7 Tactile hazed varning surface at the top and bortom of a flight f.7 An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users. a.8 Handralb f.8 Illumination at flif a.9 Second handral at a lower height f.9 Half-height mirror to rar wall. a.10 Visual contrast of handrals with surrounding surfaces g. Entreng and Exting Elements - Dors Appearance a.11 Illumination of stairs g.1 Withh of opening b. Creaking elements - Ramps g.2 Visual contrast of handrals with surrounding surfaces b.1 Ramge radies g.3 Visually contrasting markage b.2 Clear with of ramp g.4 Entreng and Exting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.3 Landinge dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrald h.0 Entering and Exting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handral at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (ruli aido) b.6 Contrast of ramp slow with harding surface i Avafinding Elements - Architectraal Wayfinding b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps h.1 Dimensions of visual lalace with with withing <td><u> </u></td> <td>Single steps</td> <td>f6</td> <td>Contrast of mounting plate with the adjacent wall surface</td>	<u> </u>	Single steps	f6	Contrast of mounting plate with the adjacent wall surface
a.7 An energency communitation system that is suitable for all users. a.8 Handrals f.8 a.9 Second handral at a lower height f.9 a.10 Visual contrast of handrals with surrounding surfaces g a.11 Illumination of stars g.1 b. Circulation Elements - Ramps g.2 b.1 Ramps gradient g.3 b.2 Clear with of ramp g.4 b.1 Ramps gradient g.3 b.2 Clear with of ramp g.4 b.3 Landinge dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrals h Enterging and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handral at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with handing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning antificing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Uptanding kerb i.2 Contrast of forway at both ends of exalator with the exalator c.2 Contrast of forway at both ends of			6.5	Contrast of mounting plate with the adjacent wan surface
a.8 Hadrals f.8 Illumination at lift a.9 Second handral is a lower height f.9 Half-height mirror tor rear wall. a.11 Illumination of stairs g.1 With of opening b.1 Ramps gadient g.3 Visual contrast of handralis with surrounding surfaces b.1 Ramps gadient g.3 Visually contrasting markings b.2 Clear with of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrals h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handral at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with labding surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactife bazard warning surfaceg on ramps i.1 Provision of visual lable with the outside b.8 Upstanding torb i.2 Clear to the interval advision at outside b.8 Upstanding torb j.2 Comprehension of visual lable with the outside c.1 Signage at the escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage c.2 Contrast of torways at both ends of e	a.7	lactile hazard warning surface at the top and bottom of a flight	f.7	An emergency communication system that is suitable for all users.
a.9 Second handrail at a lower height [.9 Half-height mirror tore wall. a.10 Visual contract of handrails with surrounding surfaces g Entering and Exiting Elements - Doors Appearance a.11 Illumination of stars g.1 Width of opening b Circulation Elements - Rampin g.2 Vision panels b.1 Ramps gradient g.3 Visually contrast in granings b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Magestanding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hourn't warning aurfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the oatside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal auritorina in signage c.1 Signage at the escalator j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of framentos Scalators k.4 b.8 Upstanding kerb k.2 Counters at different heights c.3 Rescalators j.2 Comprehension of signage <td>a.8</td> <td>Handrails</td> <td>f.8</td> <td>Illumination at lift</td>	a.8	Handrails	f.8	Illumination at lift
a.10 Vsud contrast of handraik with surrounding surfaces g Entering and Esting Elements - Doors Appearance a.11 Illumination of stars g.1 Width of opening b.1 Ramps gradient g.3 Vsually contrasting markings b.2 Celear width of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull ada) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the oatside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment Mage b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Marina and adual ble information in siguinge c.1 Siguage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of siguage c.1 Siguage at the escalators k.1 Location main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting hand at each step k.2 Countrast different heights c.5 Evalutor dimens	a.9	Second handrail at a lower height	f.9	Half-height mirror to rear wall.
a.11 Illumination of stain g.1 With of opening b Circulation Elements - Ramps g.2 Vision punds b.1 Ramps gradent g.3 Visually contrasting markings b.2 Clear wolft of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handruls h Entering and Exting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrul at lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wighting Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding lebronts - Exclutors i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.9 Ramp Illumination i Wighting (Diverall Assessment) c.1 Signage at the esclutors j.2 Comprehension of visual links with the outside c.3 Esclutor Elements - Esclutors k.1 Location and access formation entrance c.4 Visually outstanting band at each step k.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of esclutor with the esclutor c.1 Signage at the e	a.10	Visual contrast of handrails with surrounding surfaces	g	Entering and Exiting Elements - Doors Appearance
b Circulation Elements - Ramps g.2 Vision panels b.1 Ramp gradient g.3 Visionally contrasting markings b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting trip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Hardrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactic bazed varning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illimination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in siggage c.1 Signage at the escalators k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Contrast of fortway at both ends of escalator with the escalator c.6 Clear approach to desk Ker Provision of clear approach to desk	a.11	Illumination of stairs	g.1	Width of opening
b.1 Ramps gradient g.3 Visually contrasting markings b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull isido) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactle bazed warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illimination j Wayfinding Elements - Scalucal Wayfinding c.1 Sigaage at the exclutors j.1 Incorporation of visual, tack with the outside c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from man entrance c.4 Visually contrasting k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.5 Vertical dearance k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk <t< td=""><td>b</td><td>Circulation Elements - Ramps</td><td>g.2</td><td>Vision panels</td></t<>	b	Circulation Elements - Ramps	g.2	Vision panels
b.2 Clear width of ramp g.4 Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Anchitectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment. b.9 Ramp Illimination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c.1 Sigrage at the exclators j.1 Incorporation of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Verticial clerarace k.4 Provision of clear approach to desk c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter level <td< td=""><td>b.1</td><td>Ramps gradient</td><td>g.3</td><td>Visually contrasting markings</td></td<>	b.1	Ramps gradient	g.3	Visually contrasting markings
b.3 Landings dimensions g.5 Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of risual lacks with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.1 Signage at the escalators k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting shart a each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.4 Provision of clear apace for approach to desk c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear apace for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5	b.2	Clear width of ramp	g.4	Entrance doors contrast visually with adjacent walls or screens
b.4 Handrails h Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and aubible Information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Broducts and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Connters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in scated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually contrast in different	b.3	Landings dimensions	g.5	Contrasting strip on edges of frameless glass doors
b.5 Second handrail at a lower height h.1 Dimensions (pull side) b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, actule and audible information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in scatted position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.6 Clear approach area k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 <td>b.4</td> <td>Handrails</td> <td>h</td> <td>Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space</td>	b.4	Handrails	h	Entering and Exiting Elements - Maneuvering Space
b.6 Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface i Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment) b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j.1 Wayfinding Elements - Capabile Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Countrast and period foot resplate in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of deer pale in seated position c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control <td>b.5</td> <td>Second handrail at a lower height</td> <td>h.1</td> <td>Dimensions (pull side)</td>	b.5	Second handrail at a lower height	h.1	Dimensions (pull side)
b.7 Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps i.1 Provision of visual links with the outside b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Enchical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Service - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting	b.6	Contrast of ramp slop with landing surface	i	Wayfinding Elements - Architectural Wayfinding (Overall Assessment)
b.8 Upstanding kerb i.2 Glare in the internal environment b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 <t< td=""><td>b.7</td><td>Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps</td><td>i.1</td><td>Provision of visual links with the outside</td></t<>	b.7	Tactile hazard warning surfacing on ramps	i.1	Provision of visual links with the outside
b.9 Ramp Illumination j Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 <td>b.8</td> <td>Upstanding kerb</td> <td>i.2</td> <td>Glare in the internal environment</td>	b.8	Upstanding kerb	i.2	Glare in the internal environment
c Circulation Elements - Escalators j.1 Incorporation of visual, tactile and audibble information in signage c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and floor assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 <	b.9	Ramp Illumination	i	Wayfinding Elements - Graphical Wayfinding
c.1 Signage at the escalators j.2 Comprehension of signage c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.6 Illimination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width<	c	Circulation Elements - Escalators	j.1	Incorporation of visual, tactile and audible information in signage
c.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator p.2 Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator k Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Andible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4		Signage at the escalators	i 2	Comprehension of signage
c.3 Escalator dimensions k.1 Location and access from main entrance c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor	c.2	Contrast of footway at both ends of escalator with the escalator	k	Obtaining Products and Services - Service Desks
c.4 Visually contrasting band at each step k.2 Counters at different heights c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 <td< td=""><td>c.3</td><td>Escalator dimensions</td><td>k.1</td><td>Location and access from main entrance</td></td<>	c.3	Escalator dimensions	k.1	Location and access from main entrance
c.5 Vertial clearance k.3 Knee recess for people in seated position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3	<u>c.4</u>	Visually contrasting band at each step	k 2	Counters at different heights
c.5 Vertical clearance k.3 Khee Peeces for people in sealed position c.6 Clear approach area k.4 Provision of clear space for approach to desk c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3		Vertical alcourses	1- 2	Verse eren for eren le in sected e esition
c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.2	c.6	Clear approach area	k.3 k.4	Provision of clear space for approach to desk
c.7 Level moving section k.5 Ensure counter has visually-contrasting c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishe			1.5	
c.8 Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator k.6 Illumination at counter level c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) <td< td=""><td><u> </u></td><td>Level moving section</td><td>k.5</td><td>Ensure counter has visually-contrasting</td></td<>	<u> </u>	Level moving section	k.5	Ensure counter has visually-contrasting
c.9 Emergency stop control 1 Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas d Circulation Elements - Path of Travel 1.1 Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet Mark floors) m.6	<u>c.8</u>	Audible warning at the top and bottom of the escalator	k.6	Illumination at counter level
dCirculation Elements - Path of Travel1.1Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogsd.1Width1.2Obstruction of circular routes by seatsd.2Short constrictions1.3Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seatsd.3Recess of wall-mounted items1.4Visually contrast with surrounding surfacesd.4Guarding the projections into the clear widthmPublic Amenities - Restroomsd.5Seats along the corridorm.1Different toilet heightd.6Obstruction of travel pathm.2Automatic activated flush systemseCirculation Elements - Hallwaysm.3Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors)e.1Dimensionsm.4Different hand basins heighte.2Junctions between different floor finishesm.5Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background 	c.9	Emergency stop control	1	Obtaining Products and Services - Waiting Areas
d.1 Width 1.2 Obstruction of circular routes by seats d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d	Circulation Elements - Path of Travel	l.1	Seating areas that accommodate people with prams and pushchairs; people using wheelchairs and electric scooters; and for assistance dogs
d.2 Short constrictions 1.3 Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.1	Width	1.2	Obstruction of circular routes by seats
d.3 Recess of wall-mounted items 1.4 Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.2	Short constrictions	1.3	Clear aisle to the front and rear of the block of seats
d.4 Guarding the projections into the clear width m Public Amenities - Restrooms d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.3	Recess of wall-mounted items	1.4	Visually contrast with surrounding surfaces
d.5 Seats along the corridor m.1 Different toilet height d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.4	Guarding the projections into the clear width	m	Public Amenities - Restrooms
d.6 Obstruction of travel path m.2 Automatic activated flush systems e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.5	Seats along the corridor	m.1	Different toilet height
e Circulation Elements - Hallways m.3 Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors) e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet	d.6	Obstruction of travel path	m.2	Automatic activated flush systems
e.1 Dimensions m.4 Different hand basins height e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet	e	Circulation Elements - Hallways	m.3	Colour contrast of toilet with its immediate background (walls and floors)
e.2 Junctions between different floor finishes m.5 Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors) m.6 Grab rails in toilet	e.1	Dimensions	m.4	Different hand basins height
m.6 Grab rails in toilet	e.2	Junctions between different floor finishes	m.5	Colour contrast of hand basin with its immediate background (walls and floors)
			m.6	Grab rails in toilet

SM LID %	Crada	Condition	Description	Level of required
3M-0D 70	Grade	Condition	Description	improvements
$80 \le$ SM-UD % ≤ 100	А	Very Good	The shopping mall provides	Shopping mall needs very
			excellent support for the	limited improvements
			universal design principles	
$60 \le SM-UD \% \le 80$	В	Good	The shopping mall provides adequately	Shopping mall needs limited
			support for the universal design principles	improvements
$40 \le \text{SM-UD} \% \le 60$	С	Regular	The shopping mall provides partial support for	Shopping mall needs some
		-	Universal Design principles	improvements
$20 \le \text{SM-UD} \% \le 40$	D	Poor	The shopping mall do not support the	Shopping mall needs many
			universal design principles	improvements
$0 \le \text{SM-UD} \% < 20$	Е	Awful	The shopping mall do not provide support for	Shopping mall needs too many
			Universal Design principles and for people	improvements
			with disability	

Table 3 S	M-UD %	interpretation
-----------	--------	----------------

3.3 Case Study

The SM-UD tool was tested for communicability, practicality, reliability, and validity in six shopping malls, including City Center Mall, Majdi Mall, Caso Mall, Rand Gallery, and City star, which are the biggest shopping malls in Sulaymaniyah. These malls were built recently and based on our observations and informal conversations with their designers, the malls follow some principles of UD. However, their design is still not efficient enough since they consider a very limited number of UD features.

3.4 Reliability And Validity

The SM-UD tool was tested for reliability and validity. Reliability was tested through intra-rater and inter-rater reliability. Validity was also assessed through the criterion validity. Two evaluators (not including the first author) evaluated the case study using the SM-UD tool. Each rater assessed five zones on two separate occasions (period of 2 weeks between both ratings). The objectives of reliability tests were: (1) to assess the level of agreement over repeated measures and (2) to assess the level of agreement between team members (on first occasion). The reliability tests were conducted using PABAK kappa statistic (for Inter-rater reliability) and Cohens' kappa statistic (for Intra-rater reliability). To assess the criterion validity of SM-UD tool, the baseline degree of agreement for evaluators was investigated. On the first occasion that five zones of the case study were evaluated by two evaluators, the first author also evaluated these zones. For each evaluator, the degree of agreement was calculated with regard to the first author. The validity test was carried out using Cohens' kappa statistic.

3.5 Testing Results

To test the proposed tool, the authors split each case study into five zones. Each zone was evaluated by two evaluators for reliability tests, as well as testing the practicability of the tool. The Inter-rater reliability test was conducted based on two evaluators' ratings; Intra-rater reliability was carried out based on the one of evaluators' ratings in two different occasions; and the validity test compared the ratings of one of the evaluators with the first author ratings. The results of assessment also calculated based on the first author ratings.

3.6 Reliability

The results of reliability and validity tests are presented in Table 5. The ICC values show that six items had excellent reliability and six items had good reliability. The average Cohens' Kappa value of intra-rater reliability show that all items had excellent reliability. In addition, Cohens; kappa value of criterion validity indicate that two items had fair to good validity, and remains had excellent validity.

Table 4 Results of reliability and validity tests

Design factor	Inter-rater	Intra-rater	Criterion
-	reliability	reliability	validity
	Average ICC	Average	Average
	-	Cohens' Kappa	Cohens' Kappa
Stairs	0.89	0.94	0.79
Ramps	0.76	1.00	0.74
Escalators	0.95	0.91	0.91
Path of travel	0.81	0.82	0.63
Hallways	1.00	1.00	1.00
Elevators	0.89	1.00	0.82
Doors'	0.89	0.83	0.76
appearance			
Maneuvering	-	-	-
space*			
Architectural	1.00	1.00	1.00
wayfinding			
Graphical	1.00	1.00	1.00
wayfinding			
Service desks	0.93	1.00	0.87
Waiting areas	1.00	0.77	1.00
Restrooms	0.83	0.87	0.75
*No statistics are	computed.		

 $ICC \le 0.5: \text{ poor; } 0.5 \le ICC \le 0.75: \text{ moderate; } 0.75 \le ICC \le 0.90: \text{ good; } ICC \ge 0.90: \text{ excellent (Koo and Li 2016)}$

Kappa ≤ 0.40 : poor; $0.40 < ICC \leq 0.75$: fair to good; Kappa ≥ 0.75 : excellent (Fleiss, Levin et al. 2013)

4. Assessment Results

The SM-UD% is calculated for the City Center Mall (refer to Eq. 3). To obtain the SM-UD% for each of the shopping mall design factors and overall SM-UD% for the shopping mall, it is vital to determine the level of improvements of the shopping mall as a whole and the shopping mall design factors, in particular. Table 6 indicates the SM-UD% for the selected shopping mall, and also the level of required improvements (LRI) for the shopping mall design factors and the whole shopping mall. According to Table 3, SM-UD% of the shopping mall was 27.56; therefore, the grade of the universality design of the shopping mall was 'D', which shows that the shopping mall do not support the universal design principles and needs many improvements. Among the shopping mall design factors, the factors that achieve 'poor' and 'awful' SM-UD% need many and too many improvements, such as stairs, ramps, escalators, path of travel, hallways, elevators, doors' appearance, graphical wayfinding, service desks, waiting areas, restrooms, and architectural wayfinding. Only one design factor achieved 'regular' SM-UD% in the selected shopping mall, which was maneuvering space and needed some little improvements. No design factors achieved "A" and "B" grades.

 Table 5
 SM-UD% and condition of City Center Mall

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% dn-ms	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	3.09	11.1 4	34.4 3	34.0 0	D	Poor	2
Ramps	2.38	3.46	8.22	26.7 2	D	Poor	2
Escalators	2.44	12.5 7	30.7 3	33.8 5	D	Poor	2
Path of travel	2.83	11.6 2	32.9 2	34.0 0	D	Poor	2
Hallways	1.50	7.07	10.6 1	30.0 0	D	Poor	2
Elevators	1.78	17.2 6	30.6 8	32.0 0	D	Poor	2
Doors' appearance	2.00	9.58	19.1 6	22.2 2	D	Poor	2
Maneuvering space	5.00	7.2	36.0 0	50.0 0	С	Regular	3
Architectural way finding	1.00	4.01	4.01	10.0 0	E	Awful	1
Graphical way finding	2.50	4.21	10.5 3	25.0 0	D	Poor	2
Service desks	1.67	4.42	7.37	25.0 0	D	Poor	2
Waiting areas	1.50	4.01	6.02	17.1 4	E	Awful	1
Restrooms	1.83	3.46	6.34	18.3 3	E	Awful	1

Overall SM-UD %	27.56
Overall LRI	2
Level of required improve	ment: LRI; shopping mall needs very
limited improvements=5	; Shopping mall needs limited
improvements=4; shopping	g mall needs some improvements=3;
shopping mall needs many	improvements=2; shopping mall needs
too many improvements=1	

Tables 7-9 display the SM-UD% of City Star, Rand Gallery, and Caso Mall in Sulaymaniyah. The SM-UD% of these shopping malls was below 20; therefore, the grade of the universality design of the shopping mall was 'E', which shows that these shopping malls do not provide support for Universal Design principles and for people with disability. These malls need too many improvements to support Universal Design principles.

Table 6 SM-UD% and condition of City Star

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% ON-WS	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	1.55	11.1 4	17.2 2	17.0 0	Е	Awfu l	1
Ramps	0.97	3.46	3.34	10.8 7	Е	Awfu l	1
Escalators	0.89	12.5 7	11.1 7	12.3 1	E	Awfu l	1
Path of travel	1.50	11.6 2	17.4 3	18.0 0	Е	Awfu l	1
Hallways	1.50	7.07	10.6 1	30.0 0	D	Poor	2
Elevators	0.78	17.2 6	13.4 2	14.0 0	E	Awfu l	1
Doors' appearance	1.60	9.58	15.3 3	17.7 8	Е	Awfu l	1
Maneuvering space	3.00	7.2	21.6 0	30.0 0	D	Poor	2
Architectural wayfinding	1.50	4.01	6.02	15.0 0	Е	Awfu l	1
Graphical wayfinding	1.00	4.21	4.21	10.0 0	Е	Awfu l	1
Service desks	2.00	4.42	8.84	30.0 0	D	Poor	2
Waiting areas	2.00	4.01	8.02	22.8 6	D	Poor	2
Restrooms	1.33	3.46	4.61	13.3 3	Е	Awfu l	1
Overall SM-UE)%			18.55			
Overall LRI				1			
Level of required improvement: LRI; shopping mall needs very limited improvements=5; Shopping mall needs limited improvements=4; shopping mall needs some improvements=3;							
snopping mall i	needs ma	any impi =1	ovement	s=2; she	oppın	g mall r	leeds
too many improvements-1							

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% du-ms	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	1.82	11.14	20.25	20.00	Е	Awful	1
Ramps	1.49	3.46	5.15	16.73	Е	Awful	1
Escalators	1.22	12.57	15.36	16.92	Е	Awful	1
Path of	1.67	11.62	19.37	20.00	Е	Awful	1
travel							
Hallways	2.00	7.07	14.14	40.00	D	Poor	2
Elevators	1.00	17.26	17.26	18.00	Е	Awful	1
Doors'	1.60	9.58	15.33	17.78	Е	Awful	1
appearance							
Maneuvering	3.00	7.2	21.60	30.00	D	Poor	2
space							
Architectural	1.00	4.01	4.01	10.00	Е	Awful	1
wayfinding							
Graphical	0.50	4.21	2.11	5.00	Е	Awful	1
wayfinding							
Service desks	1.67	4.42	7.37	25.00	D	Poor	2
Waiting	2.00	4.01	8.02	22.86	D	Poor	2
areas							
Restrooms	1.50	3.46	5.19	15.00	Е	Awful	1
Overall SM-UI	0%			19.79)		
Overall LRI			1				

Table 7 SM-UD% and condition of Rand Gallery

Level of required improvement: LRI; shopping mall needs very limited improvements=5; Shopping mall needs limited improvements=4; shopping mall needs some improvements=3; shopping mall needs many improvements=2; shopping mall needs too many improvements=1

Table 8 SM-UD% and condition of Caso Mall

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% UD-WS	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	2.00	11.14	22.28	22.00	D	Poor	2
Ramps	1.64	3.46	5.68	18.46	Е	Awful	1
Escalators	1.33	12.57	16.76	18.46	Е	Awful	1
Path of	2.00	11.62	23.24	24.00	D	Poor	2
travel							
Hallways	1.00	7.07	7.07	20.00	D	Poor	2
Elevators	0.78	17.26	13.42	14.00	Е	Awful	1
Doors'	1.20	9.58	11.50	13.33	Е	Awful	1
appearance							
Maneuvering	3.00	7.2	21.60	30.00	D	Poor	2
space							
Architectural	1.00	4.01	4.01	10.00	E	Awful	1
wayfinding							
Graphical	2.50	4.21	10.53	25.00	D	Poor	2
wayfinding							
Service desks	1.67	4.42	7.37	25.00	D	Poor	2
Waiting	2.00	4.01	8.02	22.86	D	Poor	2
areas							
Restrooms	1.33	3.46	4.61	13.33	E	Awful	1

Overall SM-UD %	19.73				
Overall LRI	1				
Level of required improvement: LRI; shopping mall needs very limited					
improvements=5; Shopping mall needs limited improvements=4;					
shopping mall needs some improvements=3; shopping mall needs					
many improvements=2;	shopping mall needs too many				
improvements=1	-				

Tables 10 and 11 show the SM-UD% of Family Mall and Majdi Mall in Sulaymaniyah. The SM-UD% of these shopping malls was between 60 and 80; thus, the grade of the universality design of the shopping mall was 'B', which shows that these shopping malls provide adequately support for the universal design principles. These malls need limited improvements to support Universal Design principles.

Table 9 SM-UD% and condition of Family Mall

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% dn-ms	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	6.0 9	11.14	67.85	67.00	В	Good	4
Ramps	6.0 4	3.46	20.91	67.98	В	Good	4
Escalators	5.4 4	12.57	68.44	75.38	В	Good	4
Path of	5.3	11.62	61.97	64.00	В	Good	4
Hallways	3.5 0	7.07	24.75	70.00	В	Good	4
Elevators	3.2 2	17.26	55.62	58.00	С	Regula r	3
Doors' appearance	3.8 0	9.58	36.40	42.22	С	Regula r	3
Maneuveri ng space	7.0 0	7.2	50.40	70.00	В	Good	4
Architectu ral	6.5 0	4.01	26.07	65.00	В	Good	4
Graphical wayfinding	4.0 0	4.21	16.84	40.00	С	Regula r	3
Service desks	4.5 0	4.42	19.89	67.50	В	Good	4
Waiting areas	6.0 0	4.01	24.06	68.57	В	Good	4
Restrooms	4.1 7	3.46	14.42	41.67	С	Regula r	3
Overall SM-I	ID %			61.33	3	-	
Overall LRI			4				
Level of required improvement: LRI: shopping mall needs very limited							
improvements=5; Shopping mall needs limited improvements=4; shopping mall needs some improvements=3; shopping mall needs many improvements=2; shopping mall needs too many							
improvements=1							

Indicator	Mean of scores	Factor weight	SM-UD score	% CN-WS	Grade	Condition	LRI
Stairs	6.82	11.1 4	75.9 5	75.0 0	В	Good	4
Ramps	5.74	3.46	19.8 4	64.5 2	В	Good	4
Escalators	4.67	12.5 7	58.6 6	64.6 2	В	Good	4
Path of travel	5.17	11.6 2	60.0 4	62.0 0	В	Good	4
Hallways	2.50	7.07	17.6 8	50.0 0	С	Regula r	3
Elevators	3.33	17.2 6	57.5 3	60.0 0	В	Good	4
Doors' appearance	4.40	9.58	42.1 5	48.8 9	С	Regula r	3
Maneuveri ng space	8.00	7.2	57.6 0	80.0 0	В	Good	4
Architectu ral wayfinding	7.50	4.01	30.0 8	75.0 0	В	Good	4
Graphical wayfinding	4.00	4.21	16.8 4	40.0 0	С	Regula r	3
Service desks	4.67	4.42	20.6 3	70.0 0	В	Good	4
Waiting areas	4.75	4.01	19.0 5	54.2 9	С	Regula r	3
Restrooms	4.67	3.46	16.1 5	46.6 7	С	Regula r	3
Overall SM-UD %				60.	84		
Overall LRI				4			

Level of required improvement: LRI; shopping mall needs very limited improvements=5; Shopping mall needs limited improvements=4; shopping mall needs some improvements=3; shopping mall needs many improvements=2; shopping mall needs too many improvements=1

5. Discussion and Conclusion

This study was aimed to describe the developments and evaluation of a tool for assessment of universal design in shopping malls (SM-UD). A very limited number of assessment tools are available for assessing whether a public space adheres the Universal Design principles. The proposed tool assesses the universality design of shopping malls as an important component of cities. Since this tool is designed for Kurdistan, a wide range of shopping mall design factors were used based on Kurdish people perceptions. However, this broad spectrum of shopping mall design factors is capable of making this tool to be applicable in other countries with characteristics. In addition, SM-UD tool developed an easy-to-follow methodology for assessing universality design of different shopping malls. The inter-rater and intra-rater reliability tests were used to determine the reliability of the shopping mall design factors within SM-UD. In the selected shopping mall, all factors showed good and

excellent reliability. As expected, the objective design factors obtained high reliability. The least Cohens' Kappa value for intra-rater reliability belonged to waiting areas (0.77). The possible explanation for this is inconsistency in the values of "obstruction of circular routes by seats", which somewhat requires a subjective judgment. Same subjectivity might cause that path of travel obtained the least (0.63) Cohens' Kappa value for criterion validity. Overall, the reliability and validity test results showed that all items of the tool exhibit good and stable psychometric properties. A simple check on the assessment results shows that the scores of the assessment items are consistent across the case studies. For example, waiting area in City Center Mall, which is very scarce in this shopping mall has obtained a SM-UD% below 20, which shows the awful condition of this item in the shopping mall. In fact, the SM-UD% of waiting area in the City Center Mall correspond with the observation survey in this case study. The consistency between the scores of assessment items and their condition in real world provides strong support for the validity of the tool assessment items.

The SM-UD tool is useful to architects, shopping malls' owners, and city planners for increasing the awareness about the universality design of the shopping malls. This tool also helps them to prioritize investments and upgrade the shopping mall facilities. Concerning the use of a wide range of design factors to assess the universality design of shopping malls, other researchers can use similar methodology and process to develop new assessment tools for other public spaces such as parks, hospitals, and so on. The proposed tool can be used in other countries with suitable modifications.

References

ADA. (2010). Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) Accessibility Guidelines for Buildings and Facilities. In. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Architectural and Transportation Barriers Compliance Board,.

Afacan, Y., & Erbug, C. (2009). An Interdisciplinary Heuristic Evaluation Method for Universal Building Design. *Appl Ergon*, 40(4), 731-744. doi:10.1016/j.apergo.2008.07.002

Austrailian Government. (2013). Accessibility Design Guide: Universal Design Principles for Australia's Aid Program. In *Annex A: Built Environment*. 139. Canberra: Department of Forein Affairs and Trade.

Baer, B., Bhushan, A., Taleb, H. A., Vasquez, J., & Thomas, R. (2016). The Right to Health of Older People. *The Gerontologist*, 56(Suppl_2), S206-S217. doi:10.1093/geront/gnw039

Centre for Excellence in Universal Design. (2014a). *Booklet 2 - Entrances and Horizontal Circulation*. Dublin: Centre for Excellence in Universal Design.

Centre for Excellence in Universal Design. (2014b). *Booklet 3 - Vertical Circulation*. Dublin: Centre for Excellence in Universal Design.

Centre for Excellence in Universal Design. (2014c). *Booklet 6 - Facilities in Buildings*. Dublin: Centre for Excellence in Universal Design.

77 Tang Jian & Rebaz Jalil Abdullah - International Journal of Built Environment and Sustainability 7:2 (2020) 67–77

Dubai, G. o. (2017). Dubai Universal Design Code [Press release]

Equality, N. M. O. C. A. (2009). Norway Universally Designed by 2025: Action plan.

European Network on Independent Living. (2018). Severe violations of rights of disabled people in iraqi Kurdistan. Retrieved from https://enil.eu/news/severe-violations-of-rights-of-disabled-people-in-iraqi-kurdistan/

Fleiss, J. L., Levin, B., & Paik, M. C. (2013). Statistical Methods for Rates and Proportions: John Wiley & Sons.

Fogarty, D. (2017). Universal Design for Learning: A New Clinical Practice Assessment Tool Toward Creating Access and Equity for all Students. (PhD), Loyola Marymount University,

Harsritanto, B. I. R. (2016). Universal Design Application through South Korea Redevelopment (A Study Review).

Jalil Abdullah, R., & Jian, T. (2019). Using Structural Equation Modeling to Propose a Model for Shopping Complex Design Based on Universal Design Concept. *Sustainability*, *11*(6): doi:10.3390/su11061797

Kadir, S. A., & Jamaludin, M. (2012). Applicability of Malaysian Standards and Universal Design in Public Buildings in Putrajaya. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *36*: 659-669.

Koo, T. K., & Li, M. Y. (2016). A Guideline of Selecting and Reporting Intraclass Correlation Coefficients for Reliability Research. *Journal of Chiropractic Medicine*, *15*(2): 155-163. doi:10.1016/j.jcm.2016.02.012

Kusumarini, Y., de Yong, S., & Thamrin, D. (2012a). Entrance and Circulation Facilities of Malls in Surabaya: A Universal Interior Design Application. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 68*: 526-536. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.12.246

Kusumarini, Y., de Yong, S., & Thamrin, D. (2012b). Restroom Facilities of Malls in Surabaya: A Universal Interior Design Applications. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 68*: 504-514. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.12.244

Kusumarini, Y., de Yong, S., & Thamrin, D. (2012c). Signage System of Malls in Surabaya: Universal Interior Design Applications and Suggestions for Solution. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences, 68*: 515-525. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.12.245

Lenker, J. A., Nasarwanji, M., Paquet, V., & Feathers, D. (2011). A Tool for Rapid Assessment of Product Usability and Universal Design: Development and Preliminary Psychometric Testing. *Work*, *39*(2): 141-150. doi:10.3233/WOR-2011-1160

Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment. (2019a). Buildings for Everyone: Designing for Access and Usability. In *Internal Circulation: Designing Buildings for Access and Usability*. 1-27: Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment.

Ministry of Business Innovation and Employment. (2019b). Buildings for Everyone: Designing for Access and Usability. In *Pedestrian Circulation: Designing Buildings for Access and Usability* (pp. 1-9). New Zealand: Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment.

Oh, C. O. (2015). Development of Evaluation Tool and Guidelines of Space Design for Applying the Concept of Universal Design. *Korean Institute of Interior Design Journal*, 24(1): 23-33. doi:10.14774/jkiid.2015.24.1.023

Stephanidis, C., Akoumianakis, D., Sfyrakis, M., & Paramythis, A. (1998). Universal Accessibility in HCI: Process-Oriented Design Guidelines and Tool Requirements. Paper presented at the 4th ERCIM Workshop on User Interfaces for all, Stockholm, Sweden.

Story, M. F. (1998). Maximizing Usability: The Principles of Universal design. *Assistive Technology*, *10*(1): 4-12.

Story, M. F., Mueller, J. L., & Mace, R. L. (1998). The Principles of Universal Design and Their Application. In *The Universal Design File: Designing for People of all Ages and Abilities*. 31-36. North Caroline: The Center for Universal Design.

The City of Calgary. (2010). Universal Design Handbook. Calgary, Canada: The City of Calgary Community and Neighbourhood Service (CNS) Social Policy and Planning Division.

UNAMI. (2016). Report on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Iraq. Retrieved from Baghdad, Iraq: https://reliefweb.int/report/iraq/report-rights-persons-disabilitiesiraq-december-2016-enar

WHO. (2013). Disability in the Southeast Asia Region. Retrieved from New Delhi, India: http://origin.searo.who.int/entity/disabilities_injury_rehabilitation/t opics/disabilityinsear2013.pdf